



## Who's Right?

From *40 Lessons to Get Children Thinking* by Peter Wooley

You can listen to this story here: <https://bit.ly/hodjajudge>

*The Hodja is a story character thought to have originated from Turkey, though he and his stories are found in many other cultures around the world. The Hodja - also known as Nasreddin, Mulla Nasreddin, or Efendi - is sometimes wise and sometimes a fool, sometimes unemployed and sometimes a judge or religious leader. His stories are often humorous, puzzling and thought-provoking. Many of them are very short, barely qualifying as stories at all.*

*In this story the Hodja is acting as a qadi - a judge. Today he is to listen to a case in which there is a disagreement between two neighbours. The first of the neighbours stands before him and explains his side of the story. The Hodja listens attentively for ten minutes or so. Once the man has finished the Hodja considers for a minute and then says, 'You are right!' Next, the second of the two neighbours stands before him and explains his side of the story. Again, the Hodja listens and, again, he considers and then says, 'You are right!' Now, the Hodja's wife has been listening to everything. When she hears what the Hodja says to the second neighbour, she stands up and says, 'Hodja! They can't both be right!' The Hodja thinks for a moment and then says to his wife: 'You are right!'*

**Question:** So, who is right?

**Wonder:** We don't know what the neighbors disagreed about. Can you think of an example where two people disagree with each other but both people are right?

If you liked thinking about this, why not contact [kim@philosophyfoundation.org](mailto:kim@philosophyfoundation.org) for further information on joining online philosophy sessions or Q&As with a philosopher.

Can two people disagree about which foods taste best and both be right? Why or why not?

Can two people disagree that  $2+2=4$  and both be right? Why or why not?

**Do:** Circle the sentences that could be **facts**, and underline the sentences that are **opinions**.

- Blue is the best color.
- Somebody in the world thinks that blue is the best color.
- J.R.R. Tolkien's book *The Hobbit* has over 95,000 words.
- The world is not flat.
- Science class is harder than history class.
- In maths, learning addition is easier than learning division.
- Humans are the smartest animal on the planet
- It is wrong to steal from other people
- It is better to help one person a lot than to help two people a little.
- *The Starry Night* by Vincent van Gogh is beautiful

If you liked thinking about this, why not contact [kim@philosophyfoundation.org](mailto:kim@philosophyfoundation.org) for further information on joining online philosophy sessions or Q&As with a philosopher.

Are some of these more difficult to categorise than others? Why?

What is the difference between a fact and an opinion?

If *everyone's* favorite ice cream was chocolate, would it be a fact that chocolate is the best flavour, or is it an opinion? Why?

Try more Hodja Stories here: <https://www.philosophy-foundation.org/hodja-stories>

If you liked thinking about this, why not contact [kim@philosophyfoundation.org](mailto:kim@philosophyfoundation.org) for further information on joining online philosophy sessions or Q&As with a philosopher.